

MINUTES OF COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE TOWN BOARD
HELD ON MARCH 13, 2013 AT 7:00 PM AT TOWN HALL
ONE OVERROCKER ROAD, POUGHKEEPSIE, NEW YORK

PRESENT: Supervisor Tancredi
Councilman Baisley
Councilman Eagleton
Councilman Conte
Councilman Cifone
Councilman Krakower
Councilwoman Shershin
Town Attorney Nelson
Deputy Town Clerk Felicia Salvatore

*NOTE: Attachments pertaining to a particular Town Board Meeting will be found after the final minutes of that meeting, which are kept in the official minute books, held in Town Clerk's Office.

Public comments made during a Board Meeting may be heard on the audiotape of that particular meeting, which is kept in the Town Clerk's Office.

{ } designates corrections or amendments to

7:00 PM CALL TO ORDER SALUTE THE FLAG

03:13-COW1 PRESENTATION By Mark Fink-VOIP- Voice Over Internet

Mark Fink: You may recall, a year and a half or two years ago, we were initially talking about Voice Over IP, which is a way of tying all of the buildings together under one phone system using the Internet, similar like, if you use Vonage, which I use at home, but it's like an industrial strength, like comparing a Moped to a Harley Davidson. We are going for the Harley. What has made the change is FIOS High Speed Internet Service is available in all our Buildings now. So that gives us the net work backbone to connect all the buildings back here to Town Hall, not only for Data, but also for transmitting voice telephone calls back and forth within the buildings as well as going out into the outside world. So, what I'll do is just going through what I have right now. Each building has its own phone system. We have an IWATSU base system in here as well as over at the Police and Court. Highway has its own system, Sewer has its own and Water has its own and they are all incompatible and different brands and the are not linked together directly, so if we get a call here that has to be transferred down to Water or Sewer Department, we have to tell people to hang up and call " this number" and so there is that lack of professionalism by directing people around that way. We also don't have a single vendor to call if there is a problem. Each phone system is supported by different people and if something goes wrong, we have to figure out where the problem is instead of just calling one vendor to say "There is an issue, take care of it." Also, the services that are

available, such as voice mail, call forwarding, vary from building to building because they are all different systems and so what we are looking to do is having a distance experience across all buildings, voice mail delivered to your outlook in box as an attachment and there are a lot of things we can do with this new system beyond just transferring from one building to another. So Voice over IP takes your voice and transfers it into a different signal, sends it over our network from one building to another in the outside world and it's using the same Data Back for our network and getting multiple uses out of it and so it is a good economical approach as well. We are going to be using Verizon FIOS for all the buildings and so that gives us one vendor for our internet and networking, instead of the current situation now, we have Cablevision for Water and Sewer, we have Time Warner for Court and Highway and then we have FIOS here and so there is a lot of bouncing around between the different network provider servants that slows down not only our data travel, but also affects voice quality. We are planning to move all the buildings to FIOS, which is a significantly faster speed, better service. It is all Fiber Optic vs. copper and so it will be a much better service and give us the stability that we need.. Cost: The hand sets that we have here at Town Hall as well as over at Police and Court are the same and are compatible with this and so we don't need to replace any of those. We will be replacing the hand sets at Water, Sewer, Highway and Auto. There are only two sets at the Auto Department. The existing phone equipment that we have down stairs will have some upgraded components put into it, but basically the hardware that we have there is going to stay. We would just be adding new punctuality to it. The overall cost for all the hardware implementation is \$70,756. If we were to spread that out over a five year lease it is \$1435 per month. So, that is a chunk of money there. The next slide asks, "How are we going to fund that?" What we are looking to do is, we already got competitive bids in August 2011 for our dial phone telephone service. We are currently with Pay Tech. We got a bid from Earth Link, Tech II would deal with multiple vendors and they have reached out to their vendors and got quotes as well. As it turns out, the quote they got a quote they got from Earth Link was lower than the quote we got from Earth Link, so they have a lot more leverage and able to get a better price, significantly better price than we were even able to get. So, we are currently spending just a little over \$4400 a month on our telephone service for all the five or six buildings with Pay Tech. With Earth Link, identical service, line for line, each line with same functions, they are looking to provide that same service for just over \$2,000. So, we are looking at saving almost \$2400 each month just by changing our phone dial tone provider. So, if we move ahead with that, you take that savings of \$2400 a month, subtract the \$1400 lease cost, you are still saving about \$960 a month after the expense of upgrading the hardware, and if we go with the lease approach, basically the first month we have the new stuff, and we are saving money.

Councilman Cifone: Mark, what if we bought the phones, how much would that be?

Mark Fink: We got some quotes probably about two years ago, replacing all the phones here and Police/ Court, added on probably \$20,000 to \$30,000. a lot of money, because the handsets are \$500 to \$600 each, I think. It was a chunk of money for those and if we had to replace handsets here in Town Hall, but we don't have to with this approach.

Councilman Krakower: So, you are saying, \$20,000 would be the cost to buy them, but the cost through FIOS is \$70,000.

Mark Fink: No. Maybe I misunderstood your question.

Councilman Cifone: If we didn't lease the phones and bought the phones for the outlining buildings.

Mark Fink: Oh, ok. Well, you can't just buy phones for the out lying buildings, you have to buy the infrastructure to connect them back here to the Town Hall Central Phone System. So, we would have a central server here that connects all the phones and sends the signal out to the other buildings to give a dial tone to those phones. If we were just to purchase this whole package that was the \$70,000. To lease it, that's the \$1400 and change per month.

Councilman Krakower: So, the \$1400 and change per month is for the equipment and the service?

Mark Fink: No, that's just for the equipment and implementation.

Councilman Krakower: What about the service, what is the cost for the service?

Mark Fink: That's where we are saving money. We are currently spending \$4400 and if we go to Earth Link, we will be spending \$2,000.

Councilman Krakower: So, FIOS would be \$960 a month savings when you factor in the \$1400 a month lease for the equipment?

Mark Fink: Right. After paying the monthly lease, we would still be saving \$960.

Councilman Krakower: So, Earth Link Business is using the FIOS Service?

Mark Fink: No, Earth Link Business is giving us Dial tone here at Town Hall, telephone service. So, you get the hardware that connects all the buildings and gives you and hand set and then you have the telephone provider that connects you from Town Hall to the rest of the world. That is what Pay Tech is currently doing and then Earth Link gave us a competitive quote that is sweet.

Councilman Krakower: What's FIOS?

Mark Fink: Oh, FIOS is Internet Service. We currently have Internet Service at all the buildings.

Councilman Krakower: Don't we get that for Free through the ---

Mark Fink: No. We get free TV at some of the buildings, but we don't get free internet service.

Councilman Cifone: What if we got phone service through FIOS, couldn't they give us a better deal?

Mark Fink: We would then, also, have to replace all the phones here in Town Hall, the Police/Court as well, to have them all in the same system and so that would drive the price up dramatically. We had looked at doing that about two years ago when we started looking at this project.

Councilman Krakower: Did you get a price?

Mark Fink: We did, I would have to pull it up for you. I do have a quote, though, from back then.

Councilman Krakower: So the voice over IP would just be the internal transferring calls back and forth? (Right) It wouldn't be the telephone service out into the world?

Mark Fink: Right. Pay Tech currently provides that and we are looking to move to Earth Link.

Councilman Krakower: But, doesn't it potentially make more sense to have one company doing all of it? Just from a consumer side. When you package and bundle it, you save money with these companies. I thought we were just using FIOS because that's the only one Town wide. But, if we have Earth Link Business for the dial tone and FIOS just for the internal stuff, why do we really need ---

Supervisor Tancredi: Earth Link was the cheapest, right?

Councilman Krakower: Earth Link is the cheapest, but, right now we have Cablevision for some buildings, Time Warner for others and FIOS for others? (Right) Does it really make a difference if you are just going out over the Internet with the equipment, does it make a difference what internet service we have?

Mark Fink: Yes and No. Even if we weren't doing this voice over IP project, I still would be converting all the other buildings to FIOS because our data network alone would make a significant difference. Because, right now, if you are down at Water or Sewer, you are logging on stuff like Louise Baranick down at the Sewer Department has consistent issues with being kicked out of Munis when she is doing data entry. Sometimes she has trouble getting onto e-mail because she goes from sewer, bounces around the internet and Cablevision comes in to the Verizon FIOS over here, there are a lot more hops from one building to another, whereas if we had FIOS there and FIOS here, it's one circuit.

Councilman Krakower: If I have a Cablevision connection and I send an e-mail out to someone who has FIOS, it doesn't make a difference if I'm Cablevision and they are FIOS?

Mark Fink: Absolutely not. For e-mail, it is not mission critical as far as real time communication.

Councilman Krakower: I guess mission critical for putting a man on the moon, we've got mission critical, but if we are just—

Supervisor Tancredi: Trust me, Mark is right, there is a lot of down time when you are talking about staff—he's right with Louise, she complains consistently about being bumped from the system. There is a lot of down time.

Councilman Krakower: Cablevision has been out and they can't remedy that problem?

Mark Fink: Well, part of it is just the nature of—when we are connecting Town Hall to the Sewer Department for example we have what's called a VPN Virtual Private Network and it is a piece of hardware here and a piece of hardware there and it tunnels through the internet to create a virtual private network so that the two can talk to each other in a secure manner. When you have to jump through several different hops to go from one to the other, you have timing issues; you drop packets because the internet is a wild, wild West still. When you are sending e-mails you don't notice that, but when you are trying to communicate---

Councilman Krakower: So, VPN going from Cablevision to FIOS is a problem?

Mark Fink: It has been, yes.

Councilman Krakower: It's not just a cablevision connection over at the Sewer Department?

Mark Fink: It's the nature of using the internet in general to virtual networking.

Councilman Krakower: You're confident that using FIOS is going to fine?

Mark Fink: Yes, we have examples of talking to CSI (Computer Systems Integrators) where they have two buildings that are on different providers and they both went to FIOS and it was like they were in the building. The performance was significantly better and FIOS also provides faster service more compatibly than Cablevision or Time Warner.

Councilman Krakower: What is the price difference for the Internet Service with Cablevision and Time Warner and FIOS vs. just FIOS?

Mark Fink: What we are looking to get is, I think around a \$20 more per month, but we are getting twice the speed and it is also running over fiber vs. copper.

Councilman Krakower: \$20 per month Town wide?

Mark Fink: For each location.

Councilman Krakower: What's the speed?

Mark Fink: We are looking at 50 megabit down load speed and 25 megabit up load speed opposed to right now, Cablevision I think we have 15 down and 5 up and so it's an order of magnitude faster.

Councilman Krakower: Yes, but you are not comparing apples to apples, because Cablevision has 50 to 15, there are different levels of service within each company. You have to compare apple to apples to figure out what the prices are.

Mark Fink: Apples to apples, FIOS is significantly cheaper.

Councilman Krakower: Do you have the numbers though?

Mark Fink: Not with me, but I can get you those figures. Getting the same speed and same service doesn't always perfectly match, but they kind of ball park. FIOS is always significantly less expensive.

Councilman Krakower: Cost of installation is going to go along with that?

Mark Fink: There is no cost. They have already done, just in January and beginning of February, Verizon went around to all our buildings and brought the cabling to the building and they were really helpful. They had about four people out there with me going from one building to the next saying "Ok this is why we needed to come in", that was all done and they were very communicative and very helpful and they got us up and running and I think at this point we have something before the Board either tonight or next week to approve the two year contract. (Next week it will be on)

Councilman Cifone: Two year contract? Now isn't FIOS the only one capable of doing all this for these buildings, because Time Warner and Cablevision don't cover everything.

Councilman Krakower: To have FIOS as a dial tone, you are saying that would be more expensive or you didn't price it?

Mark Fink: If we were starting from scratch. A new company coming in and we were going to set up an office here and an office there and they had no phone systems, FIOS for phone system would be a viable option to look at. But, we have existing infrastructure here with all our gear down stairs and all our telephone hand sets that if we were go to get a quote from FIOS—

Councilman Krakower: You said, here we have FIOS, correct?

Mark Fink: Yes. But, if we were to go to Verizon for all our telephone service and Internet Service, that would entail buying hand sets and other networking gear that we already own.

Councilman Krakower: If the handsets are compatible with FIOS, the voice over IP, you are telling me they wouldn't FIOS - wouldn't telephone service over IP?

Mark Fink: Verizon wouldn't work with our handsets. There are only two vendors in the area that work with the IWATSU system and I think we've gone to Cornerstone for a quote and there was one other vendor as well, and they said, "Well, we don't work with the I watsu handsets and so if you want us to put together an integrated phone system, you have to buy all new handsets and the price went through the roof.

Councilman Cifone: Did you compare that price to market? (Yes) with FIOS and bundle everything together? Did they give you a price with replacing the phones? (I have not) That far out of line, they may be willing to take it all, bit the bullet and give us something extra for it. If they are getting everything from the Town.

Councilman Krakower: The other thing you said, a two year agreement. What is the price at the end of a two year agreement, because the thing that I've learned, every two years I get a different carrier because at the end of two years, they treat you like an existing customer and they don't give you a preferential rate and the most recent time, no matter what you say, "I don't want to change my service, I want to stay with you, but your price just shot through the roof," they don't change their rate.

Mark Fink: I got quotes from FIOS a year and a half to two years ago when we switched here at Town Hall and also got quotes on what it would cost to go out to the other buildings, if they had service. I got an up dated e-mail from them just two weeks ago and they have increased the speed and decreased the cost and their costs have actually gone down since two years ago.

Councilman Krakower: Well, they are competitive when they are trying to get your business, but not competitive once they have it. That's my concern. My concern is that at the end of two years, if FIOS shuts the price up to twice it is or 10 times what it is, are those phones going to be completely compatible with Cablevision or Time Warner after and everything out there, or are we going to be here two years from now stuck with them because we bought the equipment, unless we switch.

Supervisor Tancredi: VIOS is what we have at Town Hall now.

Mark Fink: VIOS is just how we get from one building to another. The Tech II, which has all the phones I WATSU system, that's the physical thing that dials from one phone to another. FIOS, Cablevision, Time Warner is just a cable company that takes internet packets. That's all that does. It's a highway you put your car on. The car is your handsets in this case. If they raise the toll significantly and you're looking for a plan B, that would be an issue, but as I just said, the history, based on what I got two weeks ago

from FIOS is that they have improved the speed and dropped the price. Not just for new customers, that's just the new prices across the board.

Supervisor Tancredi: Maybe it like, I don't know a whole lot about electronics, but with most electronics and technology, as time goes on, TV's or Cell Phones, it seems like prices are cheaper and you get more for what you purchase.

Councilman Krakower: It's become a more competitive market, but again, they treat new customers better than existing customers from company to company. They all do that. I guess my question would be, to find out from FIOS two years from now, is there a price that this will jump to that they can tell us or are we going to get the competitive rate that's out there and are the phones we get, my hope would be we don't have something that is locked into a system that if they do increase the rates significantly two years from now, that we can then go back to Cablevision and Time Warner and the other side of it, what we currently have, if sewer keeps having a problem with a connection, wouldn't we have had Cablevision upgrade that to a faster speed?

Mark Fink: It's not just a faster speed; it's also that they are on a different circuit. We go from Cablevision there, out to the internet in general, into the Verizon System into our building here. Where if we had Verizon at both locations, it's all contained within just the Verizon circuit so there are fewer hops from one building to the next and it's all digital.

Councilman Conte: And that's the cost of \$71,000 for the equipment to get it to do that, Mark?

Mark Fink: The \$70,000 is to upgrade our existing switching equipment down stairs, get handsets to the other buildings and implement and tie it all together. Who we choose as an internet provider is just how we get out to the Internet.

Councilman Conte: But the \$71,000. What is that? Is that 200 phones, one main frame, what kind of equipment is valued at \$71,000?

Mark Fink: We have for each building; the biggest chunk of it is here at Town Hall, because it's upgrading the equipment and software on that. When you get out to the individual buildings like for the Water Department, you are looking at 10 handsets at \$261 each. So, for the Water Department, you are looking at less than \$4,000 and the other departments are similar as well as far as the costs out there and then you have \$30,000 in the implementation of putting it all together, installing it, and training. So, half of it is that.

Councilman Conte: And you said, leasing it five years is for the product we were buying and the assistance, the labor, is that what you were saying in terms of leasing for 5 years? What do you do at the end of that? Do we have the option to buy the product; do they take it back, or what?

Mark Fink: One dollar buy out.

Councilman Baisley: If it's not obsolete by then.

Councilman Conte: Then would we need to spend another \$3,000 to get more equipment?

Mark Fink: Well, no, we've had these handsets for a while. We've had them since Steve Callihan, that's what, six or seven years now. The handsets are as close to indestructible, we've had a few fail here or there, but, we have had very, very low failure rate and with conversation with Tech Two, our support people last week, they said it is probably covered under contract and I think Tim said for about \$100 you can get them repaired as well because it's pretty minor stuff. So, the hardware is durable.

Councilman Krakower: So, we've had these phones for seven years now, we are going to buy the same phones or the updated version?

Mark Fink: That I don't know. If it's identical to what we currently have or, it's not like they will sell us the 7 year old model if there is a new one available. That's a good question; I will follow up with it.

Supervisor Tancredi: Ok, so you will follow up on that and Councilman Baisley asked you to check if Verizon is willing to give us the whole package and what the price would be.

Councilman Eagleton: Have you checked with other municipalities to see what they are using?

Mark Fink: I believe the City is using Cornerstone for their phone service and we've talked to Cornerstone and we would have to switch over all our hand sets because they don't support the I watsu system.

Councilman Eagleton: What about the County, are they using a similar approach? Are they FIOS?

Mark Fink: I'm not sure what the County is using. I just haven't had a chance to follow up on them.

Councilman Krakower: So, we are getting phones from them, but not phone service?

Mark Fink: No, from FIOS, all we are getting is Internet service.

Councilman Krakower: The phones are coming from Tech II. So, we are getting \$70,000 of phones from Tech II. Don't we have to do some sort of RFP or Bids for that?

Mark Fink: That's all State Contract pricing. Hardware and all implementation and labor.

Supervisor Tancredi: That's all State contract, our Attorney checked that out.

Town Attorney Nelson: The only thing, actually Mark had a State Contract number for dial tone, but you think you can do better and we were talking about having a process to acquire that dial tone, but the rest of it is all State Contract.

Mark Fink: Cornerstone is on State Contract for dial tone service. The price they gave to EarthLink to TECH II was higher than what EarthLink came in at, so. Also, we had gone out to bid in August 2011 for dial tone and we got two responses, one from Cornerstone and the other one from Pay Tech, which is now Wind Stream, I think they call it.

Councilman Krakower: So, FIOS is really not much of a part of any of this. It's just to switch over the internet service. The big cost is for Tech II with the phones? Did FIOS have a vendor they would recommend for us to look at?

Mark Fink: Absolutely, yes. I would imagine that they would have their own system for handsets. I will contact FIOS or Verizon and see if they can put together a quote on doing all our buildings, all handsets, but I am almost positive they would be significantly higher than what we are looking at here, but it's worth looking at.

Councilman Krakower: I would just be more comfortable having some other prices on phone systems to be able to compare to. (OK)

Supervisor Tancredi: I think you had at least three quotes when you spoke to me about the different systems and so if you can provide the Board with that information I think it would be helpful. Does anyone in the audience wish to speak or ask questions on this issues at this time?

Rob Rubin: I was just a little confused when you spoke of voice over the internet, you are not just talking about transferring calls between buildings, and you are talking about all incoming and all outgoing phones calls?

Mark Fink: Exactly, yes.

Rob Rubin: That's a lease for a five year period, two year period? I missed that.

Mark Fink: The lease is for a five year period.

Rob Rubin: Ok, so, it's a \$70,000+ to change or \$14,000 per month over five years?

Mark Fink: Right.

Councilman Krakower: So, the \$4,036 a month subtract out \$2,041, so the \$1400 a month is adding back in, so if we just kept what we currently have, we would be saving the \$2394 a month and buying all new phones, we would only be saving \$960 a month.

Mark Fink: Right, if we just change our dial tone from Pay Tech to EarthLink, we would be saving almost \$400 a month, but we would have our existing phone system where each building would have their own phone system and not tied together.

Supervisor Tancredi: Mark will be able to give you more information on this, there is a lot to take in. Technology is changing so much.

03:13-COW 2 PRESENTATION

By Richard Perkins-Dutchess
County Jail

REMOVED FROM AGENDA

03:13-COW NOTIFICATION

Public Hearing To Be Held On
March 19, 2013 For Site Plan
Located At 287 South Avenue
Before The Planning Board In The
City of Poughkeepsie

NOTED BY TOWN BOARD

Supervisor Tancredi: Let me just run through our Committee Reports real quick.

1. FINANCE

Councilman Krakower: No Report

2. FIRE ADVISORY

Councilman Conte: No Report

3. GOVERNMENT OPERATIONS

Councilwoman Shershin: We've contacted two insurance agencies and are in the process of getting quotes and an overview of what medical insurance they have out there and see if we can possibly get the same level of service for our employees at better premiums and we are also going to be contacting the County to see if they are going to be setting up a medical consortium and pooling all the different Town's and County employees to get a better buying group to see if we can come up with a better deal.

4. LAND USE & PLANNING

Councilman Krakower: No Report

5. PERSONNEL

Councilman Cifone: No Report

6. RECREATION

Councilman Baisley: Baseball season is getting ready to start. They've been working on the fields a little bit. We went out with Tom up to South Gate and picked the location for the new playground and it's up top where the old one was and so every thing is together in one location as opposed being spread out.

7. SENIOR CITIZENS

Councilman Baisley: The Senior Center is on the move and a lot is going on there.

Councilman Krakower: For the seniors, I just want to comment that we have a lot of really good Town employees. In addition to doing all the other things that they do, they have been chipping in over there to help get things done and they have been very efficient and working hard.

Councilman Baisley: You've got to give your Supervisor and Recreation Director compliments, too, because they are really pushing this along and it is going along pretty smooth.

8. TECHNOLOGY & EQUIPMENT

Councilman Eagleton: No Report

9. WATER, SEWER, HIGHWAY

Councilman Eagleton: No Report

Motion made to suspend the rules for public speaking on Agenda items: Supervisor Tancredi/J. Conte

CARRIED: 7-0

Rob Rubin: Again, I just have to say, Kudos to the Highway Department over that last snow storm we had, every time I looked out and every where I looked, they just seemed to be there keeping the roads clear. Nice job.

Councilman Krakower: I always know when I get back into the Town of Poughkeepsie, the roads are always plowed and sanded.

Rob Rubin: Central Hudson has been doing a lot of work out there, too. I haven't seen that as much in all my years here then what they are doing now.

RESOLUTION

BE IT RESOLVED, the Town Board of the Town of Poughkeepsie does hereby adjourn to Executive Session to consider the following matters, to wit:

1. The Hiring or Firing or Promotion or Demotion of a particular person, firm or corporation.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that there will be no action appropriating money.

SO MOVED: J. Baisley/S. Eagleton

CARRIED: 7-0

TOWN BOARD ADJOURNED AT 7:37 PM

TOWN BOARD ENTERED EXECUTIVE SESSION AT 7:38 PM

TOWN BOARD RETURNED TO MEETING AT 8:46 PM

MEETING CLOSED AT 8:47 PM

FS:lkm